

## Cal Poly MSc Aerospace Engineering – Written Thesis Feedback Form

The following criteria should be used by all committee members to evaluate the written thesis of Masters Candidates in the Aerospace Engineering department at Cal Poly. After the defense has been completed, please return this form directly to the thesis advisor (not to the student).

Thesis Content (~75%)													
Introduction and Background (literature review): Is it clear where this work lies in the context of the field in general including internal and external works?	<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>0</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>1</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>2</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>3</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>4</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>5</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">Not included</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs significant improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Good or developing</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Very good</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Excellent</td> </tr> </table>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>								
Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent								
Project Definition: What is the reason for this work and is it relevant to development of the field in general? Is it clear what the scope and motivation are?	<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>0</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>1</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>2</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>3</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>4</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>5</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">Not included</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs significant improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Good or developing</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Very good</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Excellent</td> </tr> </table>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>								
Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent								
Methodology (description): Are the methods employed fully described to the point they could be easily replicated?	<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>0</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>1</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>2</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>3</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>4</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>5</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">Not included</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs significant improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Good or developing</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Very good</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Excellent</td> </tr> </table>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>								
Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent								
Methodology (relevance): Are the methods employed relevant and correctly implemented? Are there any technical errors or problems?	<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>0</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>1</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>2</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>3</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>4</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>5</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">Not included</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs significant improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Good or developing</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Very good</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Excellent</td> </tr> </table>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>								
Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent								
Validation: How were results validated? Is the validation relevant and provides confidence?	<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>0</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>1</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>2</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>3</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>4</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>5</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">Not included</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs significant improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Good or developing</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Very good</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Excellent</td> </tr> </table>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>								
Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent								
Results (Presentation): Are results presented in a clear and logical manner?	<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>0</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>1</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>2</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>3</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>4</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>5</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">Not included</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs significant improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Good or developing</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Very good</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Excellent</td> </tr> </table>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>								
Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent								
Results (Discussion): Are results clearly discussed in a way that is relevant to the project scope?	<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>0</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>1</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>2</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>3</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>4</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>5</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">Not included</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs significant improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Good or developing</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Very good</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Excellent</td> </tr> </table>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>								
Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent								
Analysis: Does the analysis of results relate to the project scope? Is the criteria for proof clearly defined and met?	<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>0</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>1</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>2</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>3</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>4</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>5</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">Not included</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs significant improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Good or developing</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Very good</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Excellent</td> </tr> </table>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>								
Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent								
Conclusions and Future Work: The summary clearly addresses motivation, scope and project statement and provides potential areas for future development.	<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>0</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>1</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>2</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>3</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>4</b></td> <td style="width: 16.6%; text-align: center;"><b>5</b></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">Not included</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs significant improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Needs improvement</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Good or developing</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Very good</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Excellent</td> </tr> </table>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>								
Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent								

Thesis Professionalism (~25%)						
Level of Technical Detail: Does the student demonstrate a deep understanding of their topic and associated theory as expected for a Masters level graduate.	0	1	2	3	4	5
	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
Formatting and Language: Is the thesis easy to follow and read? Is the language appropriate and correct? Are figures good quality and size?	0	1	2	3	4	5
	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
Referencing: Is the thesis fully cited using in text referencing and citation lists?	0	1	2	3	4	5
	Not included	Needs significant improvement	Needs improvement	Good or developing	Very good	Excellent
General Feedback and Comments						

Converting to a letter grade – guidelines for thesis advisor and students

$$Score = \frac{Sum\ of\ awarded\ scores}{60}$$

Department recommended: A = >88%, A- = >85%, B+ = >82%, B = >75%, below 75%, set-up an 'incomplete' contract with the student